

---

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA  
ATLANTA DIVISION**

**1:16-cv-03729-WSD  
Todd et al v. Carstarphen et al  
Honorable William S. Duffey, Jr.**

---

Minute Sheet for proceedings held In Open Court on 01/05/2017.

TIME COURT COMMENCED: 9:30 A.M.

TIME COURT CONCLUDED: 1:15 P.M.

TIME IN COURT: 3:25

OFFICE LOCATION: Atlanta

COURT REPORTER: Nicholas A. Marrone

DEPUTY CLERK: Benjamin Thurman

**ATTORNEY(S)  
PRESENT:**

Anita Balasubramanian representing Atlanta Independent School System  
Anita Balasubramanian representing Meria Joel Carstarphen  
MaryGrace Bell representing Atlanta Independent School System  
MaryGrace Bell representing Meria Joel Carstarphen  
Kimberly Charles representing D.T.  
Kimberly Charles representing R.D.  
Kimberly Charles representing Daffanie Todd  
Jonathan Flack representing D.T.  
Jonathan Flack representing R.D.  
Jonathan Flack representing Daffanie Todd  
Craig Goodmark representing D.T.  
Craig Goodmark representing R.D.  
Craig Goodmark representing Daffanie Todd  
Laurance Warco representing Atlanta Independent School System  
Laurance Warco representing Meria Joel Carstarphen

**PROCEEDING  
CATEGORY:**

Evidentiary Hearing(Other Evidentiary Hearing-Contested);

**MINUTE TEXT:**

Preliminary/Permanent Injunction Hearing held. Plaintiffs presented opening statement. Plaintiffs presented the following witnesses: Daffanie Todd, Tameka Allen, and Eshkia Thomas. Plaintiffs' Exhibits 1 (redacted), 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, and 14 were admitted. Defendants presented the following witness: John Franklin. The parties are DIRECTED to file, on or before January 13, 2017, at 5:00 p.m., redline versions of their proposed findings of facts and conclusions of law.

**HEARING STATUS:** Hearing Concluded

**EXHIBIT STATUS:** Exhibits retained by the Court to be forwarded to the Clerks Office.